

Writing T-Chart Thesis-Proof Organizer

CIP 48.0703 Cabinetmaking and Millwork

Organize information for an argumentative paper by identifying support and opposition.

Program Tasks:	PA Core Standard: CC.3.6.11-12.A
<p>205: Name various types of wood and lumber used to build cabinets.</p> <p>207: Explain the differences between cabinet lumber and construction grade lumber.</p>	<p>Description: Write arguments focused on discipline-specific content.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Introduce precise, knowledgeable claim(s), establish the significance of the claim(s), distinguish the claim(s) from alternate or opposing claims, and create an organization that logically sequences the claim(s), counterclaims, reasons, and evidence. • Develop claim(s) and counterclaims fairly and thoroughly, supplying the most relevant data and evidence for each while pointing out the strengths and limitations of both claim(s) and counterclaims in a discipline appropriate form that anticipates the audience’s knowledge level, concerns, values, and possible biases.

Program Associated Vocabulary:	Writing Associated Vocabulary:
<p>Cabinet lumber</p> <p>Construction grade lumber</p> <p>Grading</p> <p>Defects</p> <p>Particle board</p> <p>Fiberboard</p>	<p>Thesis Statement</p> <p>Claim</p> <p>Argumentative writing</p> <p>Opposition</p> <p>Summary</p>

Program Strategy:	Literacy Strategy:
<p>Use the thesis-proof organizer strategy to ensure that students develop their proposition and thesis statement with appropriate evidence before they start writing.</p> <p>After introducing the thesis-proof organizer strategy and before starting the assignment, present the following prompt to the students:</p>	<p><i>Whole Group</i></p> <p>Lead students through a simulation of establishing a proposition/thesis statement and determining arguments for and against the proposition. Use a topic about which students will have strong opinions.</p> <p>Present the proposition: Same-sex schools are preferable to co-educational classes.</p>

Program Strategy:

You have been hired to construct cabinets for a new home. The client, however, insists that he wants a rustic look at a cheap price. He has suggested that you can just lumber from a barn that he recently tore down or just add finish to boards left from framing the house.

Develop a written proposal that establishes the proposition that cabinet lumber is a better choice. Make sure that you develop evidence that supports your thesis and that you acknowledge his ideas and show why they are not the best choice. Whether you get the job is dependent on how well you present your case!

Use a thesis-proof organizer to develop your evidence. You may have to conduct additional research beyond your limited experience. Make sure that your organizer includes evidence to refute using the other lumber that the owner has suggested.

At this point, meet with each student or team to discuss their recommendation and evidence. Help them determine whether they have sufficient evidence to support their recommendation before they move into writing the client proposal.

Literacy Strategy:

Have students share as much evidence as they can to support the proposition. Record the brainstorming on chart paper, the board or electronically.

Next have students share as much evidence as they can generate that opposes the proposition.

At this point, students determine their thesis statement, which will clearly state whether they support or oppose the proposition.

Share the template with the students. You can provide the template or simply show it for them to copy.

Make the point that the best argumentative writing addresses and refutes the other side. This often requires additional research.

Guided Practice

Provide pairs of students with pro and con articles on a single topic. One good source for this is [Newsela](#).

Have them develop a proposition on the topic of the articles and identify support and opposition from the articles.

Once they have completed the organizer, have them write a thesis statement.

Application

After presenting a scenario or task for students, have them develop a preliminary proposition related to the task. Use the thesis-proof organizer to record the proposition.

Based on their research or experiences, students then identify evidence that supports and refutes the proposition. These notes and their sources go into the organizer.

Once students have enough information to determine their position, have them draft their thesis statement for the assigned writing.

In debriefing, use the following questions:

- Why is it important to identify evidence for the side opposite yours?
- Why is it helpful to organize notes this way?
- Why is it important to summarize the notes?

Program Strategy:	Literacy Strategy:
	Listen for <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Understanding why it is important to identify opposing arguments. • It is important to clearly identify evidence that supports your thesis. • This activity requires students to think about a topic from multiple perspectives.

Instructor’s Script – Thesis-Proof Organizer

The thesis-proof organizer helps students determine evidence that supports or refutes their proposition. This ensures that they have investigated various options and can defend their position thoroughly.

Proposals are essentially written arguments: “what I am presenting is better than other options.” It is critical that students can identify evidence that supports their propositions. It is also important to know the counter-arguments so that they can be addressed.

Common Mistakes Made by Students

Young children attempt persuasion from a very young age. They, however, most often rely on selfish reasons to try to get someone to do what they want: “because you like me” or “because this will make me happy.” In arguments, it is critical that writers can identify not only what they want someone to do, but also the other sides of the proposition. They need to identify evidence that will support their side and evidence that might be used against this idea. This allows them to address those concerns.

CTE Instructor’s Extended Discussion

In today’s environment of home improvement and do-it-yourself television shows, people tend to believe that anything is possible in new construction and renovations. As professionals, you will need to address the client’s ideas and offer better options. Evidence should be presented professionally but in language that the layman can understand.

Sample Questions:

Career and Technical Concepts

Question	Answer
If your proposition is that cabinet-grade lumber is better than re-purposed barn lumber for new kitchens, which statement would provide the best evidence to support that proposition? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> A. Cabinet lumber accepts stains better. B. Cabinet lumber is graded. C. Barn lumber has interesting colors. D. Barn lumber is old. 	A. Cabinet lumber accepts stains better.

PA Core Reading Concepts

Question	Answer
<p>If you were identifying evidence that supports the thesis that students should be paid for grades, which of the following would be most helpful?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">A. Some students think grades would go up.B. Schools do not have money for this incentive.C. At XYX High School, grades went up when students were paid \$5 for each A.D. Researchers investigated grades at 100 schools across three states.	<p>B. At XYX High Schools, grades went up when students were paid \$5 for each A.</p>

Thesis-Proof Organizer Template

Proposition/Thesis Statement:	
Support	Opposition
Summary	
<i>Make sure to document sources.</i>	